

Crawley Borough Council

Audit Committee

Agenda for the **Special Meeting of the Audit Committee** which will be held in **virtually - Microsoft Teams Live**, on **Thursday, 29 April 2021** at **9.30 am**

Nightline Telephone No. 07881 500 227



Chief Executive

Membership:

Councillors

J Millar-Smith (Chair), M Flack (Vice-Chair), T G Belben, M G Jones and J Purdy

Please note: in accordance with Regulations in response to the COVID-19 Public Health Emergency, from April 2020 committee meetings are being held **virtually** via online video conferencing with committee members **in remote attendance only**. Any member of the public or press may observe a committee meeting (except where exempt information is to be discussed) via a link published on the Council's website **24 hours** before the scheduled start time.

Please contact Democratic Services if you have any queries regarding this agenda.

democratic.services@crawley.gov.uk

Published 21 April 2021

Emergency procedure for meetings will be circulated to Councillors and visitors attending this meeting. Please familiarise yourself with these procedures and the location of fire exits.



Switchboard: 01293 438000
Main fax: 01293 511803
Minicom: 01293 405202 DX:
57139 Crawley 1
www.crawley.gov.uk

Town Hall
The Boulevard
Crawley
West Sussex
RH10 1UZ

The order of business may change at the Chair's discretion

Part A Business (Open to the Public)

	Pages
1. Apologies for Absence	
2. Disclosures of Interest	
In accordance with the Council's Code of Conduct, councillors are reminded that it is a requirement to declare interests where appropriate.	
3. Minutes	5 - 10
To approve as a correct record the minutes of the Audit Committee held on 3 March 2021.	
4. Public Question Time	
To consider any written questions that were submitted in advance and accepted in line with the Constitution. These will be read to the Committee and be followed by a response. The questioner will receive an emailed copy of the response given at the meeting. There will be no supplementary questions.	
5. Confirmed Total Final External Audit Fees for 2019/20	11 - 12
The Council has received confirmation from Ernst and Young that the total final external audit fees for 2019/20 are £90,824.	
Following the concerns expressed by the Committee at its last few meetings that the fees would be larger than initially estimated, the final fees were then circulated to the Chair and Vice-Chair who have in turn requested that this matter be brought urgently before the Committee for its discussion.	
An extract from Ernst and Young's final Annual Audit Letter for the Year Ended 2019/20 is attached, which confirms the total final external audit fees charged.	
RECOMMENDATION	
That the Committee decide what action, if any, it wishes to take.	

6. Supplemental Agenda

Any urgent item(s) complying with Section 100(B) of the Local Government Act 1972.

This information is available in different formats and languages. If you or someone you know would like help with understanding this document please contact the Democratic Services Team on 01293 438549 or email: [democratic.services@Crawley.gov.uk](mailto:democratic.services@ Crawley.gov.uk)

This page is intentionally left blank

Crawley Borough Council

Minutes of Audit Committee

Wednesday, 3 March 2021 at 7.00 pm

Councillors Present:

J Millar-Smith (Chair)

M Flack (Vice-Chair)

T G Belben, M G Jones and J Purdy

Also in Attendance:

Councillor R D Burrett

A Brittain Associate Partner, Ernst and Young

Officers Present:

Natalie Brahma-Pearl	Chief Executive
Chris Corker	Operational Benefits and Corporate Fraud Manager
Gillian Edwards	Audit and Risk Manager
Heather Girling	Democratic Services Officer
Karen Hayes	Head of Corporate Finance
Mez Matthews	Democratic Services Officer

1. Disclosures of Interest

No disclosures of interests were made.

2. Minutes

The [minutes](#) of the meeting of the Audit Committee held on 22 September 2020 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

3. Public Question Time

No written questions had been submitted by members of the public.

4. Fraud and Investigation Team Report

The Committee considered report [FIN/524](#) of the Operational Benefits and Corporate Fraud Manager, which focused on activity for the period from 1 April 2020 to 16 February 2021. The report indicated that the Team had continued to perform successfully.

The Operational Benefits and Corporate Fraud Manager informed the Committee that, due to the Covid-19 pandemic, this was the first report being brought before the Committee for a while. The Committee noted that due to the pandemic events of 2020 the Team had been looking at new threats, specifically the three types of Business Grant which had been introduced by the Government.

The Committee was provided with details of cases investigated and the Team's investigations. The Committee sought and received clarification on a number of points raised, including the value of the current open cases set out in paragraph 6 of the report. The Committee thanked officers for the work they had undertaken, especially considering the additional work created by Business Grants.

RESOLVED

That the Fraud and Investigation Team [Report](#) be noted.

5. Progress Report and Risk Management

The Committee considered report [FIN/521](#) of the Audit and Risk Manager. The purpose of the report was primarily to update the Committee on the progress made towards the completion of the 2020/2021 Audit Plan, and to report on the progress made in implementing the previous recommendations. The report also included an update on the Council's Strategic Risks.

The Committee discussed and noted the Audit Plan Reviews, along with other work as detailed in the report. The Audit and Risk Manager took the opportunity to inform the Committee that they had taken over the review of Subject Access Requests since the departure of the Head of Legal, Democracy and HR and ensured that any such requests were handled in line with legislation. The Audit and Risk Manager then briefed the Committee on the work as detailed in the report and, in relation to the following areas, the Committee:

Work Completed in the Current Period:

- Acknowledged that the opinion of 'no assurance' given in relation to the Car Parking (Visitor Parking Permits) Audit was very unusual.
- Expressed disappointment in the issues found during the Car Parking Audit.
- Was informed that the issues with visitor parking permits had come to light since the last progress report had been tabled to the Committee. The Car Parking Audit had been carried out following an increase in visitor permits being used by staff due to changing working arrangements as a result of the Covid-19 pandemic.
- Was advised that an update on the Car Parking Audit would be brought to the next meeting of the Committee once the recommended outcomes of the Audit had been in place for a few months. That update would detail whether the controls which had been put in place as a result of the Audit had mitigated the risks identified.

Progress Report ([Appendix A](#) to the report):

- Noted that, as part of a shared service arrangement, the Audit Team had undertaken audit work on behalf of Mid Sussex District Council for the past 7 years. Crawley Borough Council had recently withdrawn from that agreement and would no longer be providing that service.

Agenda Item 3

Audit Committee (8)
3 March 2021

The Committee discussed the update provided on Strategic Risk Management. Following queries from the Committee relating to the following areas, the Committee:

Climate Emergency:

- Was informed that the Climate Change Scrutiny Panel had met throughout the summer and had completed a significant amount of work.
- Noted that it had been the intention that the assessment would be brought before the February meeting of the Overview and Scrutiny Commission and the 'significant delay', referred to in the report, related to that element of the review and not the work undertaken by the Panel itself.

New Town Hall:

- Was advised that should the Overview and Scrutiny Commission wish to have sight of the financial reports concerning the new Town Hall, it was entitled to refer them to the Commission.

RESOLVED

That the Committee receive the [report](#) and note progress to date, as at 19 February 2021.

6. Internal Audit Annual Plan 2021-2022

The Committee considered report [FIN/522](#) of the Audit and Risk Manager. The Plan, which was attached as [Appendix A](#) to the report, included an outline scope of work planned for each proposed audit area. The Audit and Risk Manager advised the Committee that the Plan had been put together in collaboration with the Head of Corporate Finance and that the Plan could be adapted, in consultation with the Council's Section 151 Officer, to take account of any future high priority issues. It was noted that a number of contingency days had been allocated for such purposes, as well as a number of days for ad hoc Covid-19 related work.

Following a query from the Committee, it was advised that the work to be undertaken within the 12 days identified as 'yet to be agreed' for ICT would be allocated following a mini risk assessment which would be completed in collaboration with the Head of Digital and Transformation. Once those days had been allocated, updated information would be provided at a future meeting of the Committee.

RESOLVED

That the 2021/2022 Internal Audit Annual Plan attached as [Appendix A](#) to report FIN/522 be noted.

7. Updated Audit Results Report: Year Ended 31 March 2020

The Committee considered the updated Audit Results Report for the year ended 31 March 2020 which was included as [Enclosure 8](#) to the agenda. The Associate Partner for Ernst and Young informed the Committee that the report was predominantly the same as that which had been considered by the Committee at its meeting on 22 September 2020, apart from a few specific changes. Those changes were highlighted as being:

- Audit differences (page 51 of the agenda pack).
- Conclusions on the valuation of property (page 58 of the agenda pack).
- Completion of the assessment relating to going concern (page 61 of the agenda pack).

The Audit Results Report set out the current status of the audit, and indicated that Ernst and Young had completed its audit of the Council's financial statements for the year ended 2019/2020.

The Committee considered matters raised, and in doing so:

- Noted that although the property valuations provided by the Council's independent Valuers had differed from that provided by Ernst and Young's independent Valuers, the total variation had been below the materiality threshold and therefore it had been concluded that those values did not need to be adjusted and could be accepted as the difference was considered to be 'reasonable'.
- Received clarification on both the valuations and the variation in valuations of Ashdown House and Atlantic House.

Following the expression of ongoing concern by a Committee member regarding the level of fees identified within the report, the Chair of the Committee advised that they had written to the Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited (PSAA) to communicate their view on the matter, as had the Head of Corporate Finance.

RESOLVED

That the [updated Audit Results Report](#) for the year ended 31 March 2020 be received and noted.

8. Exempt Information – Exclusion of the Public

RESOLVED

That in accordance with Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Act by virtue of the paragraph specified against the item.

9. Outcome of the Investigatory Powers Commissioner's Office RIPA Inspection

Exempt Part B - By Virtue of Paragraph 3
Information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information)

The Committee considered the letter which detailed the findings from the Council's recent Investigatory Powers Commissioner's Office (IPCO) inspection which was included as Enclosure 11 to the agenda.

The Committee was provided with updated information regarding both the training which had been undertaken in relation to Regulation of Investigatory Powers (RIPA) and the instances when RIPA powers had been used by the Council. The Committee was advised that this updated information would also be relayed to the IPCO.

RESOLVED

That the letter from the Investigatory Powers Commissioner's Office (RIPA) inspection be noted.

Agenda Item 3

Audit Committee (10)
3 March 2021

Closure of Meeting

With the business of the Audit Committee concluded, the Chair declared the meeting closed at 8.09 pm

J Millar-Smith (Chair)

This page is intentionally left blank

Audit Fees

In our Audit Plan we outlined the basis on which the scale fees are set by PSAA and in there and in subsequent reporting to the Audit Committee, we have outlined a combination of factors which mean that we do not believe the existing scale fees provide a clear link with both a public sector organisation's risk and complexity and therefore it endangers the sustainability of Local Audit in the future.

Description	Final Fee 2019/20 £	Planned Fee 2019/20 £	Scale Fee 2019/20 £	Final Fee 2018/19 £
Total Audit Fee – Code work	50,291	50,291	50,291	50,291
Changes in work required to address professional and regulatory requirements and scope associated with risk (see Note 1)	27,400	27,400	N/A	N/A
Revised Proposed Scale Fee	77,691	77,691	N/A	50,291
Additional work related to the audit of property valuations (see Note 2)	4,171	-	-	6,208
Additional specific one-off work required for Covid-19 considerations (see Note 3)	8,173	-	-	-
Additional work related to EFA and CIES restatement due to changes in internal reporting structure	789			
Total Audit Fee	90,824	77,691	50,291	56,499

Note 1: We presented the details of proposed resetting of the scale fee to the Audit Committee during 2020. These amounts are subject to the approval of PSAA.

Note 2: We have quantified the additional work we have undertaken, including costs associated with the work from the increased risk for property valuations in light of the Council valuer's material uncertainty disclosure and significant additional testing of property valuations and underpinning assumptions including the use of specialists. We have discussed this fee variation with management and will be seeking PSAA approval.

Note 3: We have quantified the additional work we have undertaken, including costs associated with the work resulting from the heightened risk assessment in light of Covid-19; revisiting of all risks and consideration and documentation of the impact of Covid-19. This included revisiting materiality understanding and reviewing management's going concern assessment and disclosures in relation to Covid-19; the consultation process on our audit report and the inevitable inefficiencies as a result of working remotely. We have discussed this fee variation with management and will be seeking PSAA approval.

This page is intentionally left blank